Reimagining Bristol

Our project aimed to provide pathways to reconstruct and transform Bristol so that it is no longer referred to as a tale of two cities.

client: Mayor, Marvin Rees; Bristol City Council

institution: Harvard Kennedy School of Government
MLD 375: Creating Justice in Realtime

team: Vincent Bish, Sechi Kailasa, Tahmid Islam, Kevin Robinson, Elan Kogutt, Nephthaly Leonidas

professor: Cornell Brooks, Lecturer in Public Policy
# Table of Contents

## Section One: Introduction
- 1.1 Our Team .......................... 4
- 1.2 Executive Summary .............. 7
- 1.3 Language Note ..................... 10
- 1.4 Meaning of Radical Policy ....... 15

## Section Two: The Problem
- 2.1 The Stated Problem ............... 23
- 2.2 The Refined Problem .......... 25

## Section Three: Stakeholder Interviews
- 3.1 Overview .......................... 27
- 3.2 Black South West Network ..... 28
- 3.3 Bristol City Council .......... 31
- 3.4 Babbasa ........................... 42
- 3.4 Burges Salmon ............... 42

## Section Four: Workshops
- 4.1 City Leaders ....................... 50
- 4.2 City Youth ......................... 54

## Section Five: Radical Policy Interventions
- 5.1 Community Schooling .......... 67
- 5.2 Inclusive Recruitment & Retention
- 5.3 Community-Owned Impact Investment Fund
table of contents

section six:
accountability & data

section seven:
advocacy campaigns

section eight:
conclusion

5.4 venture philanthropic capital 86
6.1 theme from interviews 91
6.2 city hub implementation 95
7.1 empire Fighting Chance 97
7.2 blog post 98
7.3 my moment ad-campaign 100
8.1 closing thoughts 110
8.2 works consulted/works cited 113
selected by the trotter collaborative, these harvard researchers come to Bristol from fields as varied as law, education, tech, and management consulting.

their collective breadth—having been faith-based community organizers to asset managers; from white house appointees to entrepreneurs in Haiti; from teaching math to mounting in-prison coding programs—position them well to make real proposals to spur economic revitalization for Bristol’s most vulnerable.
meet
our
team

interdisciplinary.
harvard-educated.
passionate about equity.

**nephthaly leonidas**  @nephthalyl

**program:** Master in Public Policy at the Harvard Kennedy School of Government

**why this work:** As a Haitian American that has come from a low-income community, I am committed to serving and advocating for those on the margins.

**previous work:** Co-Founder of Moving Haiti Forward, Co-Founder of Gilly Brewing Co, Department of State.

**tahmid islam**  @tislam

**program:** Masters in Education, Learning Design, Innovation and Technology at the Harvard Graduate School of Education

**why this work:** Deep passion for supporting young people that are most marginalized

**previous work:** Community Organiser at Citizens UK, Programme Manager UK/Europe for Peace First

**vincent bish**  @vincenthbish

**program:** Masters in Public Administration at the Harvard Kennedy School of Government, Masters in Technology, Innovation & Education at the Harvard Graduate School of Education

**why this work:** As a Black Caribbean person from the U.S., I’ve come to this work interested to see how social mobility interacts with race in different contexts.

**previous work:** White House, Slack, Connecticut Attorney General’s Office
interdisciplinary.
harvard-educated.
passionate about equity.

meet your team

elan kogutt  @elan_time_ago

program: Harvard Business School and Harvard Kennedy School of Government
why this work: As a disability rights and interfaith engagement activist, he is passionate about providing greater education and workforce access to those underserved
previous work: Aspen Institute, World Economic Forum, and NYC Dept. of Education

kevin robinson  @krobinson

program: Harvard University's Advanced Leadership Initiative, 2022 Fellow
why this work: Given both my lived experience and my professional experience I believe that providing access to fair and equitable economic opportunity is an essential obligation of a just society.
previous work: Practicing corporate and securities attorney for over thirty years.

sechi kailasa  @sech1992

program: Harvard Kennedy School of Government.
why this work: She chose to work on this project because of the opportunity that is present to build an inclusive-ecosystem in Bristol post-pandemic and the inspiring goal articulated by Mayor Rees.
previous work: Teach First and the Civil Service Fast Stream
Bristol is a city of deep history, passionate people, and an innovative Mayor. Also armed with a growing economy, Bristol is poised to capitalize on a seemingly perfect alignment of resources but—as we found, the City is also experiencing an inflection point.

Earlier this month, the City voted to dissolve a decades-long experiment with its current mayoral system—bringing to an end an unprecedented stretch of executive authority and leadership in which new ideas were proposed about what types of people and initiatives call Bristol home. Just six years earlier, this same city—one of the biggest centers of the transatlantic slave trade—elected the first Black mayor in all of Europe. As a symbol, the election of Mayor Reeves invigorated people who had been disenfranchised in the City, and all over the continent about what was possible in theirs.

In many ways, some of these shared executive summary interdisciplinary. harvard-educated. passionate about equity.

Monroe Trotter Collaborative at Harvard to partner with the Bristol City Council.

Many of the issues that have thwarted Bristol’s progress—issues around transportation, housing, and poverty along the lines of class and race—are not unique to the City. What is unique though is the initiatives of the past twenty years in Bristol have been able to upwardly inflect the economic trajectories of the upper middle class, however not changing economic outcomes for those at the bottom.

As such, we are here to explore early interventions that may prevent the current social determinants of inequality in Bristol from becoming permanent.

Part of the value we believed that we could provide is a fresh perspective in evaluating the dialectic that happens between political racial exclusion and the systems that exclusion creates. It became clear after the British Prime Minister’s Commission on Race and Ethnic Disparities report that it had chilled the air for frank discussions on things systemic racism. Claiming, among other things, that it didn’t exist. But it is the holding of this report that it’s impossible to study something you don’t believe exists.

As such, we were called on as a team of Harvard researchers, studying under Cornell Brooks, formerly of the NAACP—researchers who, themselves, are Black—caribbean, Bengali—British, Indian—British, descendants of Ashkenazi Jews, and American descendants of slavery to firmly provide a counterpoint within the Bristol context.

As a point of methodology, before we began any interview or site visits, before we engage our theory of the problem, it’s
important that we assert the assumptions that modern social science has held long before this report, that:

1. Systemic racism exists.

2. The causes of BAME under-achievement—relative to the mean—do not stem from ‘cultural deficits’ but poor design of systems.

3. The causes of white working class under-achievement—relative to the mean—do not stem from ‘cultural deficits’ but poor design of systems.

4. We advantage all citizens in policy design when we seek to advantage first the least positioned within a system.

5. Because of intersectionality, centering the blight of BAME residents, or the working class as a target group of an intervention is not to say these are the only groups that need help, but is to say that if we cannot help this group then the inequality we’re seeking to uproot will still exist.

With these five prior assertions, we form a lens through which we have spent the last four months pouring over Bristol’s one city plan, conducting workshops within it’s citizens to think through better services delivery, and querying the knowledge of the Harvard Kennedy School of Government to surface and the most progressive and radical policy interventions from around the world that may work in Bristol.

This report, given to the City of Bristol, the Bristol City Council, Cornell Brooks of the Harvard Kennedy School and Mayor Marvin Reeves is submitted as a menu of solutions to effect radical change in areas of hiring, housing, transportation, and education. We conceive of these three possible pilots as transitional seeds the Mayor might plant before his
tenure is over.

Though Mayor Rees and the Bristol City Council have accomplished in six years what many cities with twice the resources couldn’t have done in 20, the purpose of this report isn’t to flatter them.

We began our project with a deep dive into research.

Their are most certainly ways we feel we could support them in broadening the inclusive aperture of the language, or political dispositions that may, in the years left, push things forward but … our primary objective is to tackle what we’re seeing a politically.

Through working with the city council and grounded in our research we staged our research in three areas; education, building an inclusive workforce, and transportation and housing. Our 72-hour visit to Bristol involved a design-led workshop with under-represented youth across the city to understand their pain points in their schooling and careers journey to-date and holding a session with private and public sector leaders from across Bristol.

Our interviews and the visit provided considerable wealth of data and insights and informed our final phase of the project and thinking through which interventions were appropriate for Bristol. In our report we outline three proposals; community schooling, adapting recruitment and retention processes and a community impact fund. The through-line in all our research is ensuring transparency and accountability. Ultimately, therefore we recommend Bristol put in place a digital hub for tracking the progress of the One City Plan. Beyond creating accountability and greater data visibility, which was noted numerous times, this world showcases best practice across the City.

Lastly, our research team wanted to highlight the active efforts of Bristolians. We have included advocacy campaigns in our report

1. A case study on Empire Fighting Chance, a nonprofit operating in Bristol
2. A Blog post to be published on the Trotter Collaborative websites
3. A Language Toolkit
4. A campaign advert proposal that is ready to launch.
before we begin

a note on the language around race this report uses and why.

language note: 1/2
In the current political landscape of the UK, language and identity are an important tool for political mobilization. Amidst a landmark report commissioned by the British government holding that institutional racism does not exist, reports like ours must necessarily navigate against and provide counterpoint to its many regressive and flawed assertions.
The "Commission on Race and Ethnic Disparities," complicates the work of researching the social determinants of economic mobility in two key ways:

1. It has pushed politicians into a more conservative stance to talking about inequality.
   By choosing to safely center just the white-working class rather than BAME.

2. It erases the history and enflames the oppression that Asian Brits face.
   By papering over the real xenophobia they face in the workforce, and in the health care system—and using ‘the model minority myth’ to pit them against other ethnic minorities.

source: Working Class History Project

---

"17 September 1963, Raghbir Singh, a Sikh man, became the first person of colour to work on a bus in Bristol, England, after a mass campaign forced the dropping of the "colour bar" the previous month.

The ban on hiring Black or Asian workers was enforced by the Bristol Omnibus Company and the TGWU union, but after a four-month boycott workers voted to end the practice."

borrowing from the moral sources of Bristol's own history
This is why we have established a language protocol as part of how we engage with race in this report and as an important addition to our advocacy toolbox at the end of this report for the Bristol City Council.

These first principles on inclusive language are a point of policy that will aid the council to be more conscious of the multiple dimensions of discrimination in the UK so that all communities of Bristol are better served.
In the UK the intersectional discrimination of race, class and ethnicity overlaps in unique ways. Most data on race fails to consider the overlapping impact of racism and classism in British society, often pitting white working class in opposition to BAME communities in general. It is important to reiterate that both classism and racism can have a dual impact on BAME communities.

Often the rhetoric of the white working class centers the debate on racial/ethnic lines. Positioning ‘white working-class’ disadvantage as an ethnic disadvantage rather than as class disadvantage places this group in direct competition with Black and minority ethnic (BME) groups. It does very little to address the real and legitimate grievances that poor white people in Britain have. Focusing on expressing the issue of white working class through a class lens is beneficial for all working class communities.

As James Baldwin famously stated “Whatever white people do not know about Negroes reveals, precisely and inexorably, what they do not know about themselves.” That is to say that white people are impacted by racism as well as BAME communities. In the lack of humanity that racism ascribes, white people are left with an obscure vision of the world that impacts how they navigate their day to day. Addressing racism at its root would be beneficial to all races of people.

Racism in the UK operates in complicated ways. For example British Bangladeshis experience the highest rate of poverty and in work poverty, despite being one of the highest achieving minorities academically. Black African communities are 10 times less likely to own a home than their white counterparts. Black people are still the racial identity that is disproportionately targeted by police. Moreover, the impact of structural racism isn’t limited by the confines of class. It is important to hold such complexities when having a conversation about race and racism in the UK.
before we begin

a note on what radical means in the context of policy design.
what makes an intervention radical?

“Radical simply means grasping things by the root.”

–Dr. Angela Davis
traditional policy design responds to the last outcome in a chain of system failures.

- Dr. Angela Davis

"Radical simply means grasping things by the root."

- Dr. Angela Davis

while radical policy proposals seek to tackle the initial failures many layers below—the typical third-order consequences.
though straightforward, traditional policy formations often address the most proximate symptoms of an issue rather than digging deeper to interrogate social disease that produces those issues.
problem

homelessness among families in Mississippi is on the rise.

too many homeless on the street.

the working poor do not have saving to buy homes or weather economic shocks.

homelessness in Mississippi is on the rise.

the amount of time it would take to save for a house at a below wage salary is longer than a life.

the working poor do not have access to saving to buy homes or weather economic shocks.

homelessness in Mississippi is on the rise.

the amount of time it would take to save for a house at a below wage salary is longer than a life.

disease

‘the root cause’ the systemic issue

poor do not have access to capital they control.

with little possibility for wealth or mobility the poor are situationally excluded from home ownership.

a poor person alone would have to save a lifetime for the stability of a home.

hypothesis

there are not enough beds for the homeless in Mississippi.

using the root cause of the initial problem as a problem with its own roots, we can journey down into the heart of where the most powerful, creative systemic policy interventions lie.

the poor need access to capital they own to ensure their needs and basic dignity.

intervention

allocate more funding for beds in shelters in the budget.

using the root cause of the initial problem as a problem with its own roots, we can journey down into the heart of where the most powerful, creative systemic policy interventions lie.

create a community-owned impact investment fund that buys land and property the community owns and eliminate evictions.
what makes an intervention radical?

designing them to engage with the elements underneath the apparent
doctrine of the problem.

Every negative societal problem is the product of a long chain cause
and effect. Traditional interventions only address the last set of effects.

Radical policy design seeks first to consider the initial conditions that
set these societal problems into motion. By striking at the issue’s root
rather than its leaves, we imagine that we can uproot rather than
watching it grow back.
section two

the problem

stated problem:

Bristol, UK is a growing and economically wealthy city. However, with an unemployment rate of 8.2%, resident’s of South Bristol have not benefited from the economic and industry growth that has taken place in city. The residents of South Bristol are predominantly those of the Black, Asian and minority ethnic (BAME) community.
8.2% unemployment rate for residents living in Southwest Bristol or apart of the BAME community.
Bristol did not have the resources and the coordination among community leaders and initiatives to push interventions forward.

1. initial assumptions
   Bristol did not have the resources and the coordination among community leaders and initiatives to push interventions forward.

2. main stakeholders
   - BAME community
   - Youth
   - City council
   - Industry leaders
   - BSWN
   - Combined authority

quote from Bristol resident:

"The data shows that Black British individuals need support and the system has failed them."
**stakeholder map**

This is a brief stakeholder map of individuals that we engaged with and found important for the nature of this topic.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Stakeholders</th>
<th>Interests</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BAME community</td>
<td>Access and equal opportunity to a quality living via economic opportunity, education, housing and transportation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Youth</td>
<td>Mental health support and assistance with career decisions at a young age as apart of education system.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mayor Rees</td>
<td>To create a thriving city that serves all its residents and continue a successful political career.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City council</td>
<td>Serve the residents of Bristol, UK and the Mayor.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Industry leaders</td>
<td>The growth of their companies and the success of their industry in Bristol, UK.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black South West Network</td>
<td>See racial justice in Bristol, UK.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Combined authority</td>
<td>Oversee the work of Bristol City Council and maintaining order in the city.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Our initial understanding of the problem led us to three key areas that we perceived the Council must address to have a more representative workforce:

- Accessible transportation
- Successful apprenticeship pipelines
- Bridging the gap between marginalized communities and the Bristol business community.

Bristol’s inability to name a target class and point interventions towards specific communities has made interventions very dispersed.

How can Bristol City Council institutionalize interventions for a diverse, representative and inclusive workforce that serve working-class BAME residents from Bristol?
section three

stakeholder interviews

eight interviews across the public & private sector
high level overview of interview insights

- Reiteration of the tale of two cities
- Identities impact experience
- Strong values, principles and intentions
- Strong partnerships and coalitions
- Lack of data, accountability
- Lack of resilient implementation e.g. driven by individuals
- Education system not equipped to support youth e.g. apprenticeships
- Poor systems in place to facilitate transition to work
A Black-led organization that delivers race equality work through research into the social and economic issues that affect Black and Minoritised communities, the development of voice & influence and contributing to cultural inclusion.

A TALE OF TWO CITIES: REIMAGINING BRISTOL

SECTION 3: INTERVIEWS
The green transition in Bristol is an opportunity for the youth of Bristol with intentional intervention.

A TALE OF TWO CITIES:
REIMAGINING BRISTOL

education is not the problem... structural racism is.

- anonymized quote from our interviews

SECTION 3: INTERVIEWS

key takeaways

1. There is no clear target and metrics for the city and partners to achieve stated goals and programs are not connected with the communities.

2. Lack of high quality apprenticeships for black and brown individuals.

3. The green transition in Bristol is an opportunity for the youth of Bristol with intentional intervention.
key challenges

1. Establishing clear targets with buy in from stakeholders.

2. Scaling initiatives through government.

3. Bristol, UK has the ability to lead the U.K in addressing institutional racism. However, it may be met with backlash.

There is a gap between the vision of the mayor and the rest of the institution.

- anonymized quote from our interviews
organization:

bristol

city
council

interview topics & teams

2.1. economic development & skills
2.2. one city team
2.3. finance team
2.4. economic development
2.5. public health
Transportation is an issue for low-income youth. If you live on the edge of the city, many of the good jobs are located in the north of the city.

There is a need to connect marginalized communities to growth industries. There is also a lack of insight into careers.

There is a need for more apprenticeship opportunities that directly lead to jobs. The funding of the apprenticeship is complicated and accessing the funds for a small company is a barrier.

Transportation is an issue for low-income youth. If you live on the edge of the city, many of the good jobs are located in the north of the city.

...converting some of the intention to delivery

- anonymized quote from our interviews
...the data shows that black British individuals need support and the system has failed them.

- anonymized quote from our interviews

key challenges

1. Constrained government role and financial capacity to support initiatives.

2. The need to connect businesses to the community (business to communities, business to schools, families to business).

3. Communities on the margin are cut off from certain jobs and opportunities. Schools in South Bristol need to have the knowledge to access apprenticeships. Lack of digital access for some of these communities is also important.
Geography is a key determinant of inequality; 67% of residents have a university education, but in the South of Bristol about 7-12% of young people will have some form of higher education.

- anonymized quote from our interviews

Key takeaways

1. Bristol is still a very segregated city. There's a lot of wealth in this city but it also holds some of the largest areas of deprivation, it is constantly overlooked because of the former fact and because it's in the South.

2. The One City Approach was experimental, it has started to change the culture of how city partners work together and with the City.

3. The southern and northern fringe are some of the most deprived areas, they're traditionally white working class, not diverse areas, long term workless-ness, very little employment. When manufacturing closed removed most major employment in the South of Bristol.
During recruitment, people are looking for themselves in many instances and not recognizing they may need to meet citizens where they are at.

- anonymized quote from our interviews

primary sectors now are professional services; law finance etc. as opposed to manufacturing. Even the creative services industry is not particularly high paying at the outset- all of these are difficult to access. Secondly, understanding where the City has employment shortages, opportunities and the workforce that desperately needs access to these opportunities would be a key challenge to address.

Bristol needs employers to understand and meet citizens where they are coming from e.g. not everyone will know how to navigate the world of work. SMEs may need to be supported in someway to ensure they provide meaningful employment and support to residents. One idea could be provide free transport as part of your work force benefits.

The Council needs to have better engagement with communities, whilst we have limits to how many anchor organizations we can work with ideally we would want the capacity to be able to work with all areas across the city.
Some of the practices used in this department have been to always insist on seeing the long list of interview candidates, and diverse leadership being involved in the selection of key individuals. Even the short list needs to be diverse.

To be committed to ensuring diversity may require you to be not be hierarchical in your approach because diverse candidates may not necessarily be in senior roles.

Diversity will require those in leadership roles to step up, they will need to demonstrate a willingness to put things in place whether it be shadowing, mentoring, sponsoring etc. they need have the appetite to go beyond what exists.

If you don't have diversity in the room, have you got the right people around the table? If not, use your power and role to pull up a chair—whether that's to a young voice, a person with a disability etc.

- anonymized quote from our interviews
bristol city council
finance team

**key challenges**

1. Initiatives driven by individuals, can be ad-hoc, institutional resilience will be key for long term change that is also immune to the political cycle/values of the leadership team. Very little diversity prior the Mayor or acceptance of the challenges and there was institutional racism - long term resiliency of initiatives is key.

2. Unconscious bias remains a challenge the city faces. Even after a generation the workforce is more representative but not in the tiers you expect. You can have policies but need to embed things, not just have it as a tick box exercise.

3. A huge constraint is data; we need better data so we can target interventions much more effectively and not on perceptions.

“There’s a lot of pre-conceptions in terms of the level of qualifications required for a role, these are real inhibitors of converting intent into action.”

- anonymized quote from our interviews

SECTION 3: INTERVIEWS
There is a real drive for stakeholders across this city to work together.

- anonymized quote from our interviews
bristol city council
 economic development team

key challenges

1. It’s hard to evaluate the delivery and the impact of organizations and partners over time.

2. There’s a lot of good intentions and in the short run projects start, but it’s a lot harder to continue them in the long run.

3. It’s difficult to access the funding we need as we are seen an economic centre of our region— we contribute to over half the economic output of the region.

"keeping the coordination going into the long run is the challenge and converting some of the intention into delivery"

- anonymized quote from our interviews
bristol city council
public health team

key takeaways

1. City partners and the city itself has a strong understanding of the determinants of health inequality; poverty, social conditions etc. This is unlike other areas in the South West. There is a will to address this multi-faceted problem.

2. Access to good work is one of the primary determinant of good health.

3. Austerity dismantled many of the structures, programs and coalitions that existed. There is a coalition right now in the city regarding Public Health. We need to facilitate and enable these partnerships.

There's an acceptance in this city that targeting health inequality; is aiming for social justice.

- anonymized quote from our interviews
bristol city council

public health team

key challenges

Between some groups in this city there is a 10 year gap in life expectancy - this gap has increased.

- anonymized quote from our interviews

1. Workforce is diverse getting in, many minority communities are also coming in with enormous talent. But people leave because they do not progress. Boards aren't diverse. There are so many structural barriers that prevent progression.

2. Other problems are the lack of cultural awareness in workplaces and the lack of knowledge on how to navigate the social systems found in workplaces.

3. We need to address the upstream challenge as a priority; we need to focus on protecting the most vulnerable, reducing the number of people that require social protection and create social resilience. It's like Maslow's hierarchy; if everyone has access to good work, affordable transport etc. we can gain resilience to the massive existential threats we face.
Babbasa is a Bristol-based social enterprise offering support services in career-orientated event management, skills training, mentoring schemes, recruitment and consultancy services to third party agencies; for the benefit of young people from less advantaged communities.
key takeaways

1. We believe young people can grow into their roles with support; companies should keep this in mind if they’re really intent on diversity—they should help young people transition into their roles perhaps through internships first.

2. A lot of the young people don’t have any aspirations at all, we try to start here; show them the possibilities in front of them. This seems to be a generational issue.

“Huge businesses are a stone's throwaway from communities, yet a lot of young people don’t think they have anything to do with them; feel alienated.”

- anonymized quote from our interviews

SECTION 3: INTERVIEWS
Babbasa is a Bristol-based social enterprise offering support services in career-orientated event management, skills training, mentoring schemes, recruitment and consultancy services to third party agencies; for the benefit of young people from less advantaged communities.

Burges Salmon is an award-winning independent UK law firm based in Bristol, UK. Competing at the top-end of the legal market. The firm prides itself on delivering an excellent standard of legal and business advice to its clients, which has led to many of the firm’s practice areas and sectors winning awards and recognition as best in class.
key takeaways

1. City of Bristol public sector drove equity-based initiatives previously; currently the private sector is more focused and engaged in equity centered undertakings, such as investments involving ESG wherein racial justice is considered.

2. City of Bristol youth are very passionate about equity...demanding that the public and private sector consider racial justice.

"We must define Equity not only as appearing at the door but going through and beyond the door."

- anonymized quote from our interviews
My father was Jamaican, he moved to the UK and in the early 60s, my mother is white Welsh and a cleaner...I was the first one a for my family to go to university. So I had no guidance. So at University College London, I did chemistry, but just before going to university, I was involved in a case...

me and my friend were both mixed race were the ones who [were wrongly] arrested....it almost affected me going to university but [the charges] all fell through. That sparked my interest in law....

To be honest with you, I did also apply to some law firms in London [after having my PhD and LLB] and got a couple of rejections there, but, thankfully I got a training contract [apprenticeship], relatively easily. But, then, I didn't even realize how different I was to everybody else once I got in...

I think George Floyd's murder sort of made me look back and think about things and about my experiences again, and, you know, it’s taken a long time for my firm even to actually get to a place where it's when it's much more racially diverse, but if it is something is really doing if something’s really focused upon.

-a Black junior executive at Burges Salmon
direct quotes from city experts:

"Transport has fallen to the wayside for years, navigating the city to work if you're a young person in the South Side will take you an awful lot of time and money, we are incredibly disjointed"

"need to support careers all the way through not just when you're coming out of university, but lifelong support"

"the lack of comprehensive data to assess progress on DEI recruitment and hiring"

"Converting some of the intention to delivery"

"We need to be better at engaging with communities and our anchor community organizations, we need to strengthen our existing set of networks so that we cover the entire city"

"there's a real drive to work together, there is a lot of energy around this, but it's hard to evaluate monitor the delivery and impact of a range of partners"
There were four workshops conducted among main stakeholder groups during our trip to Bristol, UK. These workshops allowed us to engage the community as a partner and add qualitative insights the data could not give.

- Bristol City Leaders Workshop
- Bristol Youth Workshop
In order to be people-centered and create a fit-for-purpose intervention ecosystem, we used human-centered design.

Human-centered design allows us to co-create and lift up the voices of the community in the ways that they want Bristol to look.
community workshops: 1 of 2

city leaders

section three: workshop highlights
There is a lack of joined up process. People are doing good work but are not connected. Potential for physical spaces to hold convening and workshops.

There is a need for strategic intervention from the council. There is recognition from the council about the structural problems but needs to be a specific policy intervention.

Growth industry needs to be held accountable. There needs to be coordinated investment and accessible training for young people as well as small to medium sized businesses.
inclusive workforce

main idea discussed:

how might we create a workforce that represents the diversity of Bristol's demography at all levels of an organization across the public and private sector?

what they offered:

1. It was also mentally exhausting and they were concerned that addressing the problem had become circular.

2. Bristol has many identities within the city, these affect the process of recruitment and retention

3. This was a complex problem, stakeholders had tried multiple initiatives and were concerned that policy responses weren't giving rise to impact in the expected timescales.
transportation & housing

main idea discussed:

how might we hold local Bristol city government accountable to create transportation and housing that enables those to be in community with others?

what they offered:

1. The location, density and standards of new developments are dictated by the (SDS) the Spatial Development Strategy set across the West England area. This implicates everything from housing prices to building areas.

2. Transportation desert is split along geographic and racial divides.

3. The regional political context is critical when it comes to transportation and housing. Any intervention must operate around these constraints first.
9 young people and staff members were in attendance from Babbasa, a local Bristol social enterprise that supports young people in accessing employment and professional development.

The groups were split in 2 with each group sharing their aspirations for creating a Bristol with more accessible opportunities for young people.
The exercise was to develop a vision map identifying a 'how might we...' statement connecting to a problem related to employment the young people may be experiencing.

We arrived at the statement by initially identifying some of the pain points and opportunities the young people felt existed based on their own stories. Then using the How might we statement, the young people identified the key target groups, barriers and needs.
For group 1, young people had shared various different challenges that they had experienced. It ultimately came down to the fact that young people felt huge amounts of pressure in regards to their mental health in trying to find employment.

Particular workplaces being all white spaces, pressure from parents, navigating workplace rejections and schools not being equipped to handle pressure of not getting grades were all factored. Young people made it clear that there is a need for communities of care that should be built in from early ages.
On the need for earlier intervention strategies

“You need to hit at the base! When these children are eleven, twelve, thirteen—that is when you’re going to see the most change. Because now we’re a broken generation of twenty-one and twenty-two year olds trying to find our way. You should have helped us more when we were twelve or thirteen.”

Ellie Placide
21-years old
For group two, the conversation focused on how identity was a particularly significant pain point. Being from certain communities or different backgrounds meant that you didn't have access to the information/knowledge in how to access opportunities and how to navigate the processes you may even not be empowered to act on the knowledge if you had it. Moreover, it's difficult to navigate once you get to the workplace too there's a lack of awareness and acceptance.

Some of the opportunities we identified as a group were the following: workshops in schools on simple topics as how to build a CV or write a cover letter, the City council could host careers fairs. The young people we spoke to had the motivation, they simply didn't know how to interact with the world, even once they do the structures didn't feel like places where they could be themselves/ progress/ have the mental energy to last.
Holding space and community that tackles mental health issues.

Intervention and support from educators in careers from an early age.

Experiences of racism, islamophobia and other forms of discrimination make it more difficult to find employment. Especially in industries that are predominantly white spaces.

main idea discussed:

how might we develop schooling systems that support young people in their careers as well as create communities of care?
section five
radical policy interventions
For the future of Bristol
determining the type of intervention

When thinking of the best policy interventions that would address the key concerns that was presented in the research and in stakeholders interviews, we used three criteria:

1. Are the concerns of those most on the margins heard?
2. Are the interventions feasible and thread the political needle?
3. How can these interventions be institutionalized from administration to administration?
Structural racism as well as class dynamics and geographic barriers impact the most marginalized communities in Bristol and bar them from economic opportunity in three predominant ways:
The interventions are actions the City of Bristol must take in serving the most marginalized in the community. Specific focus on working class and BAME community through these interventions will lead to diverse and inclusive workforce the city is hoping for.
three promising interventions

after weeks of research we’ve evaluated policy interventions that interceded in the lives of citizens early enough to catalyze systemic change for Bristol’s most marginalized citizens.

section five: policy interventions
possible interventions

community schooling

inclusive recruitment & retention

community-owned impact investment fund
CASE STUDIES

community schooling.

CASE STUDY:
Lawrence Public Schools
LAWRENCEVILLE, MA

inclusive recruitment & retention.

CASE STUDY:
Nehemiah Manufacturing Co.
CINCINNATI, OH

community-owned impact investing fund.

CASE STUDY:
Ujima Impact Fund
BOSTON, MA
1 in 4 Bristolians are young people under the age of 24.

43% childhood development gap along ethnic lines for Bristol’s children in their earliest years.

Only 17% of Bristolians from BAME communities enter apprenticeships.

Only 17.5% in South Bristol matriculate into higher ed.
What is community schooling?

A methodology of schooling that Integrates schools with the wider communities giving parents and students opportunities to interact with school in more holistic ways. Essentially giving the community more control over schooling processes.

Community schooling provides opportunity to engage students and parents in employment, healthcare, after school programs and financial well-being, learning that is not necessarily including in conventional education system.
Case Study: Lawrence Public Schools

Lawrence, Massachusetts is a city with predominantly working class communities of colour. The city has long been challenged by a failing public school system and lack of job prosperity for its predominantly Latinx communities.

To address this issue the city set up Lawrence Working Families Initiative. Lawrence Public Schools and Lawrence Community Partnerships developed a cross-organisational coalition working with local non-profits and businesses integrated with schools to further support parents in employment and student success. The initiative developed a family centre that provided parents with careers services, workshops and children to after school programming.
The evidence here suggests that the initiative has had a significant impact on the way parents engage with schools as well as significant increases in academic achievement of kids. In addition to the impact on schooling, multiple resources and connections have been made available to caregivers that have supported them in successfully acquiring local jobs. The results can be seen in a steadily increasing job market in Lawrence and a declining unemployment rate in the city pre pandemic.
From most of our interviews and in our community workshops, schooling and education has been a prominent issue that has come up for the people of Bristol. It seems that schools are not equipped to educate young people in alternative education like Apprenticeship programs.

Community schooling could be a great way to address the issues of lack of connection between business, non-profits and schooling. Community schooling could also address young people’s challenge of education not being equipped to teach about prospects for young people.

A community schooling programme could connect the great work that local non-profits and businesses are doing in upskilling young people with communities that need that support most. Community schooling could also create a space for young people and parents to gain further knowledge on alternative forms of education like apprenticeships in more integrated ways.
Implementing Community Schooling: Bristol Youth Access Initiative

Bristol Youth Access Initiative would be a cross-collaborative program with schools, small and medium sized businesses as well as non-profit organisations that provides employability and professional education to young people from South Bristol. Youth Access Initiative would work with local schools in co-ordinating programs with local business and non profits in offering young people and their families the support they need to gain access to employment in Bristol City. An example of a programme could look like bringing local schools in South Bristol together to an apprenticeship information event hosted by On Site Bristol.

The Initiative would fulfill the need to join up the great programming and processes that are not being linked in Bristol. It would also offer the information and learning via schools that conventional education could not provide for young people and parents.
Implementing Community Schooling in Bristol: Bristol Youth Access Initiative

Implementation Considerations:

1. **Invest in the process and Implementation.** Consider offering grants to organisations that become partners of the initiative. Seed funding that could support organisations to develop programmes for the initiative will be important in ensuring Youth Access Initiative’s development and accountability.

2. **Community Participation and Buy-In.** Community being actively involved in the initiative is essential to the theory of community. Engage community in all elements of programming design. Consider creating a community oversight board that overseas the key decisions and budgeting of the initiative.

3. **Accessibility is Essential.** Embed accessibility into the every functional part of the initiative. Consider how childcare, transportation and disability may impact how programs are implemented. Work to provide funding for transportation and childcare costs. Develop a draft accessibility protocol that can be implemented for programming.
1 in 4 men in England & Wales has a criminal record.

33% is the amount Bristol prisons are over capacity.

13th greatest prison-to-population ratio in UK

Education & employment are the main determinants of whether someone recidivates.
What would inclusive recruitment and retention look like?

Inclusive recruitment and retention requires employers to recognize that in order to achieve a diverse work force, the first step is to establish diverse and creative recruitment practices. Moreover, employers should establish post-hiring support metrics. Those practices may consist of:

1. Dual track recruitment and retention
2. Second chance recruitment and retention
Dual Track Recruitment and Retention Practices:

This practice encourages employers to "meet employees where they are", beginning with an interview module that not only reviews potential employee qualifications related to explicit job listings but also engages diverse candidates by understanding the following about them:

- Where Are They At The Point in Their Life's Journey
- What Barriers Have They Face
- How Can Employers and the City Of Bristol Partner To Address the Above Questions and Provide Support Through-Out the Employment Cycle
Second Chance Recruitment and Retention

Employers should consider potential employees that typically would otherwise not be considered because of their criminal history. By doing so, Employers not only fill vacancies but help to address the racial hiring gap created by judicial and carceral inequities.

Case Study: Nehemiah Mfg. Co.
Inclusive recruitment & retention.

Implementation Considerations:

90% of businesses in Bristol are SMEs

INCENTIVES:

1. Costs of expanded support for non-traditional employees including dedicated, transparent and repeatable support functions required to facilitate implementation in SMEs.

2. City of Bristol would drive partnerships between private sector employers, NGOs, and community foundations to assist in implementation logistics and costs.

3. City of Bristol and its private sector employers would not only tap into a larger employee pool but would also position themselves as social impact thought leaders.
community-owned impact investment fund

50% is the amount private rent has increased in the last decade.

> 1/4 of UK small and medium-sized businesses sought protection from eviction in 2021.

35% of people in the UK living in deprived areas lack bank accounts.

1 in 4 of UK applications for Social Fund loans are turned down; one in four of the rejected applicants borrow from doorstep lenders and loan sharks.

£330 million amount people on benefits borrow a year on home credit, paying £140 million in interest.
An investment structure created to fund community projects in the City of Bristol. Fund investors consist of philanthropic and institutional investors who invest, in part for the benefit of specifically targeted diverse community members.

CASE STUDY: Ujima Impact Fund
What is the Ujima Project?

The Ujima Model is a multi-stakeholder group comprised of community members, businesses, activist, impact investors, faith organizations and others that come together to use their collective resources to establish a community controlled capital fund. Each contributing member becomes apart of the governing board and will receive one vote when making decisions.

The governing board decides what businesses and real-estate initiatives the fund will invest in and what community centered business practices they would like those entities to uphold. There are spectrum of projects that the community owned impact investment fund invest in.
community-owned impact investment fund.

the main idea

community land trust

community owned endowment
A community land trust is a nonprofit corporation that holds land on behalf of a place-based community, while serving as the long-term steward for affordable housing, community gardens, civic buildings, commercial spaces and other community assets on behalf of a community.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>bond type</th>
<th>limits</th>
<th>rate of return</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>philanthropic</td>
<td>&lt; £3.8K</td>
<td>3% in 3 yrs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>accredited</td>
<td>£1k - £200k</td>
<td>3% in 3 yrs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>community</td>
<td>£38 - £7.5K</td>
<td>1.5% in 7 yrs</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Why the community owned impact investment fund for Bristol?

A community led fund that includes those most marginalized on the governing board, could further the equity pipeline in workforce opportunity and an equitable Bristol that the city seeks to create because of the community centered practices the fund requires.

Housing is still a continuous critical for equity in the city. Stability in living contributes to upward economic mobility. A Community Land Trust is one way to continue to further the endeavor for affordable housing. The trust would allow for the community to self determine what housing and living investments and initiatives would best serve their community and that maintain affordability.

A fund of this sort, democratizes the investment practices in Bristol and allows for the most marginalized community members to participate in governing which can bring the longterm economic change and impact necessary for communities on the margins.
Implementation Considerations:

1. Understanding the Fund. It will be important to speak with those like the Ujima Fund that can inform the beginnings of establishing an investment fund of this nature.

2. Investment appetite. There will need to be engagement with key stakeholders to determine the appetite for this type of project from potential investors and/or impact investment funds and their willingness to relinquish control.

3. Community engagement. Along with engaging investors, ensuring that key community organizers and advocacy networks are apart of the discussion and participation of the board will be critical. Understanding the communities appetite for this form of investment will also be necessary.
Investing directly in community-based organizations to be stewards for change within their city. It drives accountability and creates more lasting effects for individuals and their communities.

CASE STUDY: Fresno, California
The Kresge Foundation partnered with Fresno, California residents for job training and employment services and provide technical assistance to small business. They did this through partnerships with local organizations and community-based organizations to create greater capacity for the city’s community development infrastructure.

The capital was used to directly invest in community-based organizations dedicated to workforce training, upskilling, and communal health needs.

What is 'venture philanthropy' and how does it work in Fresno, California?

venture philanthropy initiatives
In order to seed Bristolian-driven change in the city's under-resourced neighborhoods, direct community investment of philanthropic capital can be used to supplement a lack of transportation infrastructure.

In the first iteration and pilot, philanthropic capital will be invested directly in community initiatives in South Bristol that will connect South residents with transportation for job training and employment services.

One such partner organization could be Bristol Community Transport that provides low cost minibuses for the community in Bristol.
venture philanthropy initiatives

implementation considerations:

1. **Find the right partner.** This could be a currently operating civil society organization, such as Bristol Community Transport, or a new community-based organization. This entity must believe in the power of the community to institute change. Find additional private and public sector actors that can partner.

2. **Ensure Longevity.** Have a back-up plan if it does not go well. The current lack of transportation is not tenable. What would it look like if it does not improve?

3. **Replicate Successes.** Once the pilot with one civil-society organization for transportation is up-and-running, replicate across the city. Ultimately, this venture philanthropy initiative can be replicated across other civil society areas.
section six

accountability, data and benchmarking
Bristol ONE CITY PLAN is extensive. There has been a number of initiatives enacted based on the data to best serve the most marginalized.

However, a through line in many of our interviews was the need for benchmarks, mechanisms of accountability and central collection of data on the process and/or successes/shortcomings of initiatives. One interviewee stated:

“How do we target our interventions better? We need better data so we do not just act on perceptions or perceived vulnerabilities.”
In our interviews, it was also stated that there was a gap between Mayor Rees' vision and the buy-in from stakeholders that interviewee’s thought could only be resolved by clear target metrics that all partners must reach. We found that The One City Plan has a number of targets, but the information aggregation is not easily accessible or known. Without adequate, clear and transparent messaging and tracking of data and status of the city initiatives on its benchmarks targets it may not have its intended impact. This is necessary for the success of existing initiatives and new ones. The city may be collecting the data but there is not a centralized place to access data. This is particularly important for communities to access and Small Medium Businesses to know what and how to implement pertinent and successful interventions.
ONE CITY HUB

benchmarks & accountability  
data  
progress & success

unified resource / platform layer on which apps and dashboards can be built to increase:

CLARITY. TRANSPARENCY. BUY-IN.
One City Hub is will be an online platform that anyone can access to track the progress of the One City Plan and its initiatives serving to make Bristol a more equitable city. This hub would also act as a showcase of stories and success so that all residents of Bristol’s are aware of what is taking place in their city. The city would work to integrate and track all initiatives through the hub that would allow for community buy-in, transparency, accountability and trust for current and future interventions.
Bristol has a number of interventions that are functioning successfully. However, the awareness of the success of these interventions are unclear to those working towards seeing an equitable and continuously thriving Bristol for all.

While we believe the interventions presented within this presentation can contribute to the excellent efforts of the city to serve the most marginalized, with the shift in governance structure within Bristol, we believe that the One City Hub may be the best strategy for the interventions created and led by the One City team to have longevity and be institutionalized from administration to administration. Evidence of the success of the initiatives and general community buy-in could prevent the overhaul that tends to happen from administration to administration.

Lastly, small businesses are a large part of Bristol’s economy. Establishing a team member to work with business to implement policies that will allow them to create and meet the vision of the One City Plan will be a critical step.

Listed to the right of this page are the next steps we believe the city should take given the importance of the proposed interventions.
section seven
advocacy campaigns
**Empire Fighting Chance Case Study**
charity that provides boxing therapy & careers services

---

**CHALLENGES:**
- Capacity challenges
- Buy-in from business leaders
- Buy-in from national government

**PURPOSE:**
- Facilitates buy-in from local business leaders
- Provides spot light and focus on innovative model of facilitating disadvantaged young people into jobs

**TIMELINE:**
- Write draft of case study for project deadline also highlight in our Blog Post
- Reach out to professors and networks to see if there's interest in formalizing the case (HBS, HGSE)
- Facilitate the formalization of creating the case study

**CASE STUDY PROPOSAL:**
HTTPS://DOCS.GOOGLE.COM/DOCUMENT/D/1UXW101BQRD1RF5XMFQ2U01UJILGZBG-/EDIT?USP=SHARING&OUID=107563958114208896727&RTPOF=TRUE&SD=TRUE

---

**SECTION 7: ADVOCACY CAMPAIGNS**

**A TALE OF TWO CITIES: REIMAGINING BRISTOL**

**CHALLENGES:**
- Capacity challenges
- Buy-in from business leaders
- Buy-in from national government

**PURPOSE:**
- Facilitates buy-in from local business leaders
- Provides spot light and focus on innovative model of facilitating disadvantaged young people into jobs

**TIMELINE:**
- Write draft of case study for project deadline also highlight in our Blog Post
- Reach out to professors and networks to see if there's interest in formalizing the case (HBS, HGSE)
- Facilitate the formalization of creating the case study

**CASE STUDY PROPOSAL:**
HTTPS://DOCS.GOOGLE.COM/DOCUMENT/D/1UXW101BQRD1RF5XMFQ2U01UJILGZBG-/EDIT?USP=SHARING&OUID=107563958114208896727&RTPOF=TRUE&SD=TRUE
The blog post summarizes our journey, research, client visit and some broader reflection on the City of Bristol.

A version of it can be found using the link below. It will be published on the Trotter Collaborative Website along with the other group projects in our course.

[Blog Post Link]
Narrative Advertisement Campaign

objective:
create a social media ready advertisement, as a vehicle for listening, learning and recording the stories of hundreds of Bristolians ahead of our policy launch.

as a point of strategy, it would allow the flexibility to:

1. **gauge** public sentiment (hot, cold, luke warm, as well as public approval) before launch.

2. tweak the intervention’s pilot/implementation informed by public sentiment.

3. **reach out** to those stories on twitter and instagram we want to include.

4. track the #MyMomentMatters for data insights and analysis
we begin with...

an **old black carribean man**
on a city bus.

The technical disparities are visible.

**shot:**
*wide*
Put in the man's shoes and his job search experience.

close in on the newspaper’s job posting...

Put in the man's shoes and his job search experience.

shot: reverse shot
It is a seamless transition from paper to computer.

we cut to a new scene...

the same job listing—but it appears on a laptop.

It is a seamless transition from paper to computer.

shot: close up
a reverse shot reveals a disabled South Asian girl with her father peer at a laptop.

Automatic emotional appeal in familial setting.

shot: close up; reverse shot
... the man is attempting to get someone’s help to finish his application to that job while his bus back home leaves through the window.

shot: medium
He holds a sign saying: “I don’t work here.”

shot: wide

wide shot of a wind farm with the old black man in front…
wideshot of a tv studio with the south asian girl in front.

She holds a sign saying: “I don’t work here.”

shot: wide to medium
wideshot of a large tech company with the older white man in front.

He holds a sign saying: “I don’t work here.”

shot: medium to wide
bristol city council puts things in context.

Mayor Marvin Rees and city leadership discuss ambitions and actions to introduce radical solutions for workforce equity.

shot:
medium
A voice over says: 
“We are creating a vibrant, strong economy in Bristol.

But not for all. Help us create a more equitable Bristol.

Because #MyMomentMatters

shot:
test campaign storyboard

#MyMomentMatters

honest.
unexpected.
a source of analytics.

inspiration for the city and Bristolians to inspire hope in the future of the workforce and how it will include all of its community.

estimated cost: £20,000
estimated reach: 50K
estimated impressions: 60K
time to execute: 6 months
conclusion

Bristol's has a number of initiatives that can prevent hurdles and create economic opportunity for people at the intersection of race, class, disability, and access.

Bristol under the leadership of Mayor Rees and the One City team have done an excellent job in pushing and enacting innovative initiatives to challenge the status quo that has existed in the city. These initiatives are expansive and have endeavored to be radical in approach by acknowledging the disparities most experienced by marginalized community members. The city has the opportunity to be a leader in the United Kingdom and across the globe. Bristol can build on its success driving equity in areas of workforce, education, and transportation and housing. With this foundation, it can remediate historical troubles and under-represented populations to build in more radical interventions for a more equitable workforce. We are grateful to be in service to a brighter future alongside Bristolians.

A TALE OF TWO CITIES: REIMAGINING BRISTOL

SECTION 8: CONCLUSION
works consulted


Kresge Foundation: Community Support in Fresno, California https://kresge.org/initiative/kresge-community-support-fresno/


McKinney de Royston, Maxine, and Tia C. Madkins. “A Question of Necessity or of Equity? Full-Service Community Schools and the (Mis)Education of Black Youth.” Journal of Education for Students Placed at Risk (JESPAR), vol. 24, no. 3, July 2019, pp. 244–71,

Reimagining Bristol

Our project aimed to provide pathways to reconstruct and transform Bristol so that it is no longer referred to as a tale of two cities.

client: Mayor, Marvin Rees; Bristol City Council

institution: Harvard Kennedy School of Government
MLD 375: Creating Justice in Realtime

team: Vincent Bish, Sechi Kailasa, Tahmid Islam,
Kevin Robinson, Elan Kogutt, Nephthaly Leonidas

professor: Cornell Brooks, Lecturer in Public Policy